

# COMMITTEE ON OPEN GOVERNMENT

STATE OF NEW YORK  
DEPARTMENT OF STATE  
ONE COMMERCE PLAZA  
99 WASHINGTON AVENUE  
ALBANY, NY 12231-0001  
TELEPHONE: (518) 474-2518  
FAX: (518) 474-1927  
[WWW.OPENGOVERNMENT.NY.GOV](http://WWW.OPENGOVERNMENT.NY.GOV)

**COMMITTEE MEMBERS**  
RUTH N. COLON  
ANTONIO DELGADO  
PETER D. GRIMM  
HADLEY HORRIGAN  
JEANETTE M. MOY  
CHRISTOPHER POLICANO  
ROBERT J. RODRIGUEZ  
FRANKLIN H. STONE  
BLAKE G. WASHINGTON  
STEPHEN B. WATERS

**EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR**  
SHOSHANAH BEWLAY

## **DRAFT MEETING MINUTES**

### **NYS COMMITTEE ON OPEN GOVERNMENT**

**December 6, 2023, at 12:00 pm**

#### **Members Present in Person:**

**Albany:** Ian MacCallum (OGS), Jacob Salzmann (Lt. Gov.), Amy Ottaviano (Budget)

**New York City:** Zoila Del Castillo (Secretary of State), Franklin Stone, Christopher Policano

**Buffalo:** Hadley Horrigan

**Member Present by WebEx, pursuant to Section 103-a of the Open Meetings Law:** Stephen Waters

#### **Executive Director's Staff Present in Person:**

**Albany:** Shoshanah Bewlay, Kristin O'Neill, Miguel-Carlo Bautista

**Executive Director's Staff Present by WebEx:** Christin Smith, Candace Watson

**Welcome:** Introduction of members and Director's staff.

#### **Quorum present**

#### **Approval of Minutes:**

On a motion to approve the minutes of the October 3, 2023, meeting of the Committee, all were in favor and the minutes were approved.

#### **Discussion of the 2023 Annual Report:**

The Executive Director reviewed the draft Report with Committee members. During lengthy deliberations, members made the following motions:

- Motion to revert to draft of report circulated on October 30, 2023:

**Aye:** Zoila Del Castillo, Amy Ottaviano, Jacob Salzmann, Ian McCallum.

**Nay:** Franklin Stone, Stephen Waters, Chris Policano, Hadley Horrigan.

No action taken.

- Motion to revert to draft of Introduction circulated on October 30, 2023:

Aye: Zoila Del Castillo, Amy Ottaviano, Jacob Salzmann, Ian McCallum.

Nay: Franklin Stone, Stephen Waters, Chris Policano, Hadley Horrigan.

No action taken.

- Motion to amend language of "Section E. Structure of the Committee on Open Government" as discussed during meeting:

Unanimously passed.

- Motion to amend introductory bullet point regarding the use of algorithms as discussed during meeting:

Unanimously passed.

- Motion to use language regarding use of algorithms from 2022 annual report:

Aye: Zoila Del Castillo, Amy Ottaviano, Jacob Salzmann, Ian McCallum, Hadley Horrigan, Christopher Policano.

Nay: Franklin Stone, Stephen Waters.

Motion carried.

- Motion to weave in footnotes from version of algorithm section not included in report pursuant to prior motion.

Aye: Franklin Stone, Stephen Waters.

Insufficient Aye votes to pass motion. No action taken.

- Motion to revert to draft of Introduction circulated on October 30, 2023:

Aye: Zoila Del Castillo, Amy Ottaviano, Jacob Salzmann, Ian McCallum, Hadley Horrigan.

Nay: Franklin Stone, Stephen Waters. Abstain: Chris Policano.

No action taken.

- Motion to approve the annual report with edits agreed as discussed:

Unanimously passed (Hadley Horrigan had previously left the meeting due to a commitment and did not vote). Chris Policano abstained.

Directly following the final motion to approve the report and the vote thereon, members who had commitments that that they were already late for left the meeting. In the absence of quorum, the Committee was unable to conduct further business and the meeting was adjourned.

**Adjourned:** 2:48 pm.